

SECTION '2' – Applications meriting special consideration

Application No : 12/00609/FULL1

Ward:
Bickley

Address : The Widmore 3 Bickley Road Bickley
Bromley BR1 2NF

OS Grid Ref: E: 541858 N: 169191

Applicant : McCullochs

Objections : YES

Description of Development:

Conversion and refurbishment of former public house into a single five bedroom family dwelling including partial demolition of single storey rear elements and addition of single storey extension and elevational alterations. 2 four bedroom detached dwellings and 1 five bedroom detached dwelling on land at 'The Widmore' with associated accesses, parking areas and landscaping

Key designations:

Local Distributor Roads
Locally Listed Building

Proposal

This application was deferred from Plans Sub Committee on 16th August 2012 without prejudice to any future consideration to seek a reduction in the number of houses to two. The applicant has reduced the size of plot 2 by removing the single storey projection closest to Bickley Road. They consider that this is a significant reduction in appearance, footprint and bulk, opens up the space around the Listed Building and creates a larger garden area for that plot. They consider that the houses and plots 2 and 3 are almost equivalent on terms of presence and size to that which a large single house would occupy. Additionally a confidential Development Viability Assessment has been submitted which substantiates the applicant's claims that a reduction in the number of dwellings would mean that the scheme would not be commercially viable. The previous report is repeated for information:

- The proposal is to convert the existing listed building from a public house to one residential dwelling and to construct three additional family dwellings within the site.
- Works to the existing structure include the demolition of part of the listed building and the construction of a new single storey rear extension attached to the main building by a glazed link.

- The converted dwelling will have 5 bedrooms spread over the first and second floors as well as a dressing room and en suite bathroom to the second floor. The ground floor will accommodate living accommodation and the basement will accommodate a bar, cinema room and wine cellar. Access to the converted public house is proposed to be from the existing access from Bird in Hand Lane.
- The proposal also includes the construction of 3 new dwellings, one 5 bedroom and two four bedroom properties, all of which are part one/two storeys with accommodation in the roofspace.
- Plot 1 is accessed via the existing vehicular access from Bickley Road and includes a detached single storey double garage to the front. This plot is to the north west of the public house and is proposed to occupy the area currently used as a car park.
- Plots 2 and 3 are accessed via a new vehicular access from Bird in Hand Lane and both of these properties have integral single garages. These plots are located to the south east of the site and occupy what is currently the pub garden.
- Plot 2 is located on the corner of Bird in Hand Lane and Bickley Road and fronts Bird in Hand Lane. This plot has three bedrooms at first floor and a fourth bedroom with en suite and dressing room at second floor level.
- Plot 3 is located on Bird in Hand Lane adjacent to No. 49 Bird in Hand Lane. This plot has three bedrooms and bathrooms at first floor and a fourth bedroom and bathroom at second floor level.

Location

- The site is located to the south of Bickley Road on the corner of Bickley Road and Bird in Hand Lane.
- The site currently accommodates 'The Widmore' public house which is a grade II listed building and has been unoccupied for approximately 10 months. The property is an eighteenth century painted brick building consisting of two storeys and an attic with two front dormers. The property has been extended over time with nineteenth and twentieth century additions to the rear. The eighteenth century section of the building is made up of two ranges with a tiled mansard style roof and timber sash windows.
- The surrounding area is mainly comprised of residential dwellings, although to the north of the site on the opposite side of Bickley Road there is a car showroom and garage and to the north east of the site are playing fields.
- The residential dwellings in the surrounding area are mixed in terms of size and design. Bickley Road and Widmore Road are largely a mixture of substantial detached and semi-detached family homes set back from the main roads as well as some larger flatted development. Bird in Hand Lane is a narrower road and contains large, mainly detached family houses. There are flats known as Sharon Court to the south west.

Comments from Local Residents

Nearby owners/occupiers were notified of the application and representations were received which can be summarised as follows:

- development will be high quality and appropriate addition
- gates not in keeping with the neighbourhood and noise from motor
- overall support for the development
- loss of light
- loss of outlook
- loss of privacy
- Plot 1 will overlook properties in the vicinity
- where will cars from BMW garage park?

A petition in support of the application from 16 nearby properties has been submitted to the Council. The reasons for support are summarised as follows:

- density and type of housing is agreeable and in keeping
- visibility and density of 2 houses on former beer garden area would not warrant rejection
- land may be offered for sale to McDonalds should the application be rejected.

Comments from Consultees

English Heritage have commented that the existing building is an important local landmark, although given there is no longer a sound business case for retaining the building in its current use, residential use would seem to be appropriate. In relation to the demolition and re-building of the single storey rear element, this should be determined in accordance with national and local policy and guidance. However, there is concern that providing three additional units will neither enhance or better reveal the significance of the designated asset of the listed building. This as well as the proposed gates will cause permanent harm to the openness of the site, which is an important historic feature.

With regard to the revised plans, English Heritage have commented that the re-orientation of the proposed building on Plot 1 is welcome and it is considered that this would enjoy a more comfortable relationship with the listed building - its principal facade now engages with the listed building which is considered to be a real improvement - and would allow for a greater sense of openness between the listed building and the proposed building. A more contemporary approach to the architectural treatment of the principal facades of this proposed building might bring forward a more reticent building (although it is appreciated that this may be at odds with the wider townscape of this area). Regarding Plots 2 and 3, it has always been a concern that any development on what has historically has been an open area that has made a positive contribution to the setting of the listed building risks compromising that sense of openness.

Some encouragement is taken from the fact that the proposed houses on these two plots have been pulled away from the listed building such that the northern facade of the proposed building on Plot 2 allows for a greater sense of openness on the corner of the site. Having said this however, there is no doubt that one detached house (or even a pair of semi-detached houses) rather than two on the land to the east of the listed building would reduce the impact upon the listed

building's setting even further. If there are compelling reasons why a pair of semi-detached houses on Plots 2 and 3 is not achievable then the revised proposal shown on Drawing 553/03 D is only just acceptable in respect of the proposed development's impact upon the setting of the listed building.

From a housing point of view, there have been concerns raised in terms of lighting and views to some of the rooms in the converted public house and plot 1.

From an Environmental Health point of view, there are no objections raised.

From a highways point of view, the proposed gates should be set back 5 metres from the highway or omitted. They also comment that the access to the converted public house, now being the only entrance and exit from this site would lead to unusual turning movement at this junction.

From a drainage point of view there are no objections subject to conditions.

Thames Water has raised no objections to the proposal.

There are no objections from a trees aspect.

Planning Considerations

The application falls to be determined in accordance with the following policies of the Unitary Development Plan and the London Plan:

- BE1 Design of New Development
- BE8 Statutory Listed Buildings
- C1 Community Facilities
- H1 Housing Supply
- H7 Housing Design and Density
- H9 Side Space
- H12 Conversions of Non-Residential Buildings to Residential Use
- NE7 Development and Trees
- T11 New Accesses
- T18 Road Safety

The National Planning Policy Framework 2012 is also a consideration.

From a Heritage point of view, there are concerns that three additional dwellings on the site would result in harm to the setting of the statutory listed building. Additional comments on the revised scheme are as follows: "This 18th Century structure has historically enjoyed a relatively spacious curtilage which has become part of its character and added to the special interest which lead to it being listed. I note the revised proposals and feel the the moving of one of the units to the far NW corner has improved matters but the pair of houses along Bird in Hand Lane still appear cramped and too close to the Listed Building and a single house in this SW corner location would be preferable."

No significant trees would be affected by the proposal.

Planning History

Planning permission was granted for single storey side and rear extensions, rear boundary wall and additional parking spaces in 1994 under reference DC/94/00448/FUL. Details pursuant to a landscaping condition were also granted under reference DC/94/01896/DET.

Listed Building Consent was granted in 1994 for single storey side and rear extensions, internal and external alterations and partial demolition under reference DC/94/00449/LBCALT.

Advertisement Consent was granted in 1994 for externally illuminated post signs, internally illuminated menu signs and non-illuminated wall sign under reference DC94/02217/ADVILL.

Listed Building Consent was granted in 1994 for externally illuminated post signs, internally illuminated menu signs and non-illuminated wall sign under reference DC94/02345/LBCALT.

Listed Building Consent was granted in 1999 for new advertisement signs to the building and forecourt under reference DC/99/00187/LBC.

Advertisement Consent was granted for non illuminated and externally illuminated advertisement signs in 1999 under reference DC99/00202/ADV.

Planning permission was granted for a 1 metre high fence to the rear garden area in 2003 under reference DC/02/03500/FULL1.

Listed Building Consent was granted for a replacement chimney piece in 2003 under reference DC/02/03579/LBC.

Planning permission was granted for the siting of a flower stall at weekends in 2004 under reference DC/04/01213/FULL1.

Planning permission was granted for a detached canopy over patio area to the side elevation in 2007 under reference DC/07/03166/FULL1.

Listed Building Consent was granted for a replacement non-illuminated wall mounted sign in 2009 under reference DC/08/04008/LBC.

Advertisement Consent was granted for an externally illuminated free standing totem sign and non illuminated wall mounted and free standing signs in 2009 under reference DC/08/04010/ADV.

Conclusions

The main issues relating to the application are the effect that it would have on the special interest of the statutory listed building, the character of the surrounding area, the impact that it would have on the amenities of the occupants of surrounding residential properties and the impact on highway safety.

The conversion of the public house itself into one large family dwelling with basement area and accommodation in the roof space is, in principle considered to be acceptable. Evidence that the existing use of the premises is no longer viable has been submitted and the Council are satisfied that this use has been explored without success, with regard to Policy C1. Given the mainly residential character of the area, the conversion of the public house into one residential unit is considered to be appropriate and in keeping with the other forms of development in the area, and will assist in the long term retention of and improvement to the Listed Building.

No significant changes are proposed to the front of the existing listed building and the appearance of the building itself in the streetscene is therefore unlikely to be significantly altered. The demolition of the later rear additions is not considered to be harmful to the fabric of the statutory listed building. The proposed replacement single storey extension is considered to be well designed, with minimum impact on the listed structure itself. Whilst this element is large, it is attached via a small glazed corridor and given its distance from both 49 Bird in Hand Lane and the properties at Sharon Court, this element is unlikely to affect the visual amenities, light or privacy currently enjoyed by these neighbouring properties, nor will it appear dominant and is therefore considered to be acceptable. The access to this property is from an existing access from Bird in Hand Lane and whilst this is an unusual access given the road layout immediately adjacent to the access, it is not considered unduly harmful to road safety. The rear garden area to the listed building is limited and would benefit from being larger to reflect the size of the dwelling it will serve. Although there may be some conflict with Policy BE1 in terms of the amenity space for the converted house, overall the changes to the listed building comply with Policy BE8.

The proposal also includes three new detached dwellings, one of which is to be located to the north west of the site with the other two to be located to the south east. Plot 1 (north east of the site) retains the existing vehicular access from Bickley Road and has a detached double garage. The garage is sited to the front/side of the property and is of a considerable size. It is considered that this plot is suitable for housing one detached dwelling of an appropriate size, siting and design. Despite its overall size, the design of the dwelling may be in keeping with some other residential dwellings in the wider area, and the revised scheme pays appropriate respect to the statutory listed building in terms of the increased separation, complying with H7, BE1 and BE8.

The dwelling at plot 1 is close to Sharon Court to the rear, and due to its proximity to these flats, the occupants may experience some impact on visual amenity and prospect, and the new dwelling will be the dominant view from the front windows of the closest flats. There may also be issues with overlooking both to and from Sharon Court and the listed building. This requires careful consideration with regard to Policy BE1.

Plots 2 and 3 are considered to be cramped, particularly given their size and number of bedrooms. It is considered that neither of these plots, particularly plot 3 benefit from sufficient amenity space to the rear of the property. Given the central position of the listed building and the restrictive shape of the site, it is not considered that these two properties fit well within the site or relate well to the

listed building. The dwellings would appear cramped in the streetscene and result in an overdevelopment of the site. There may also be a harmful relationship with the neighbouring property No. 49 Bird in Hand Lane due to the side dormer window which currently overlooks the pub garden. These considerations must however be balanced against the benefits of bringing the listed building back into use and improving the overall appearance of the site. The amendment to Plot 2 has improved the space around that building and increased the amenity space to be provided. These factors must be considered with regard to Policies H7, BE1 and BE8.

The overall layout of the site has been improved since first submission and the proposed layout does allow for a suitable amount of space around the listed building, particularly to the front. The scheme does however include unconventional designs for plots 2 and 3 in order to achieve houses of the size required within a very limited space, and these do appear slightly awkward, and both would have limited amenity space, as would the listed building. Members are asked to carefully consider whether the three new dwellings can be satisfactorily accommodated on this site and to balance the benefits of redeveloping the site and restoring the listed building to use with whether the development as a whole would be likely to detract from the importance of this local landmark, with regard to the UDP policies mentioned above.

Background papers referred to during production of this report comprise all correspondence on files refs. 12/00608 and 12/00609, excluding exempt information.

as amended by documents received on 27.07.2012 20.09.2012

RECOMMENDATION: MEMBERS' VIEWS ARE REQUESTED

- | | | |
|---|-----------------|--|
| 0 | D00002 | If Members are minded to grant planning permission the following conditions are suggested: |
| 1 | ACA01
ACA01R | Commencement of development within 3 yrs
A01 Reason 3 years |
| 2 | ACA04
ACA04R | Landscaping Scheme - full app no details
Reason A04 |
| 3 | ACA07
ACA07R | Boundary enclosure - no detail submitted
Reason A07 |
| 4 | ACC01
ACC01R | Satisfactory materials (ext'nl surfaces)
Reason C01 |
| 5 | ACC03
ACC03R | Details of windows
Reason C03 |
| 6 | ACD06
ADD06R | Sustainable drainage system (SuDS)
Reason D06 |
| 7 | ACH03
CH03R | Satisfactory parking - full application
Reason H03 |
| 8 | ACI01 | Restriction of all "pd" rights |

Reason: In the interests of protecting the setting of the statutory listed building with regard to Policy BE8 of the Unitary Development Plan.

- 9 ACI17 No additional windows (2 inserts) first floor dwellings
ACI17R I17 reason (1 insert) BE1
- 10 ACI18 No additional hardstanding

Reason: In the interests of protecting the setting of the statutory listed building with regard to Policy BE8 of the Unitary Development Plan.

- 11 ACK01 Compliance with submitted plan

Reason: In the interests of protecting the setting of the statutory listed building and the amenities of the area with regard to Policies BE1 and BE8 of the Unitary Development Plan.

- 12 ACK05 Slab levels - no details submitted
ACK05R K05 reason
- 13 AJ02B Justification UNIQUE reason OTHER apps

Policies (UDP)

- BE1 Design of New Development
- BE8 Statutory Listed Buildings
- C1 Community Facilities
- H1 Housing Supply
- H7 Housing Design and Density
- H9 Side Space
- H12 Conversions of Non-Residential Buildings to Residential Use
- NE7 Development and Trees
- T11 New Accesses
- T18 Road Safety

The National Planning Policy Framework 2012 is also a consideration.

INFORMATIVE(S)

- 1 You are advised that this application may be liable for the payment of the Mayoral Community Infrastructure Levy under the Community Infrastructure Levy Regulations (2010) and the Planning Act 2008. The London Borough of Bromley is the Collecting Authority for the Mayor and this Levy is payable on the commencement of development (defined in Part 2, para 7 of the Community Infrastructure Levy Regulations (2010)). It is the responsibility of the owner and /or person(s) who have a material interest in the relevant land to pay the Levy (defined under Part 2, para 4(2) of the Community Infrastructure Levy Regulations (2010)).

If you fail to follow the payment procedure, the collecting authority may impose surcharges on this liability, take enforcement action, serve a stop notice to prohibit further development on the site and/or take action to recover the debt.

Further information about Community Infrastructure Levy can be found on attached information note and the Bromley website www.bromley.gov.uk/CIL

D00003 If Members are minded to refuse planning permission the following grounds are suggested:

- 1 The proposal will result in an overdevelopment of the site, detrimental to the character and appearance of the area and the setting of the statutory listed building situated to the centre of the site, contrary to Policies BE1, BE8, H7 and H9 of the Unitary Development Plan.

- 2 The three additional dwellings proposed would result in significant harm to the open setting of the statutory listed building by reason of their siting, scale and design, contrary to Policies BE1 and BE8 of the Unitary Development Plan.

Application:12/00609/FULL1

Address: The Widmore 3 Bickley Road Bickley Bromley BR1 2NF

Proposal: Conversion and refurbishment of former public house into a single five bedroom family dwelling including partial demolition of single storey rear elements and addition of single storey extension and elevational alterations. 2 four bedroom detached dwellings and 1 five

